Highly sensitive and specific multiplex antibody assays to quantify immunoglobulins M, A and G against SARS-CoV-2 antigens

Carlota Dobaño^{1,2}, Marta Vidal¹, Rebeca Santano¹, Alfons Jiménez^{1,2}, Jordi Chi¹, Diana Barrios¹, Gemma Ruiz-Olalla¹, Natalia Rodrigo Melero³, Carlo Carolis³, Daniel Parras⁴, Pau Serra⁴, Paula Martínez de Aguirre⁵, Francisco Carmona-Torre⁶, Gabriel Reina⁵, Pere Santamaria^{4,7}, Alfredo Mayor^{1,2,8}, Alberto García-Basteiro^{1,8,9}, Luis Izquierdo¹, Ruth Aguilar¹, Gemma Moncunill¹

¹ISGlobal, Hospital Clínic - Universitat de Barcelona, Catalonia, Spain. ³Biomolecular screening and Protein Technologies Unit, Centre for Genomic Regulation (CRG), The Barcelona Institute of Science and Technology, Barcelona, Spain. ⁵Clínica Universidad de Navarra, Navarra Institute for Health Research (IdiSNA), Pamplona, Spain. ⁶Infectious Diseases Division and Clinical Microbiology, Clínica Universidad de Navarra, Pamplona, Spain. ⁷Julia McFarlane Diabetes Research Centre (JMDRC) and Department of Microbiology, Immunology and Infectious Diseases, Snyder Institute for Chronic Diseases, Cumming School of Medicine, University of Calgary, Alberta, T2N 4N1 Canada. ⁸Centro de Investigação em Saúde de Manhiça (CISM), Maputo, Mozambique. ⁹International Health Department, Hospital Clinic, Universitat de Barcelona, Spain.

ABSTRACT

Reliable serological tests are required to determine the prevalence of antibodies against SARS-CoV-2 antigens and to characterise immunity to the disease in order to address key knowledge gaps in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic. Quantitative suspension array technology (qSAT) assays based on the xMAP Luminex platform overcome the limitations of rapid diagnostic tests and ELISA with their higher precision, dynamic range, throughput, miniaturization, cost-efficacy and multiplexing capacity. We developed three qSAT assays to detect IgM, IgA and IgG to a panel of eight SARS-CoV-2 antigens including spike (S), nucleoprotein (N) and membrane (M) protein constructs. The assays were optimized to minimize processing time and maximize signal to noise ratio. We evaluated the performance of the assays using 128 plasmas obtained before the COVID-19 pandemic (negative controls) and 115 plasmas from individuals with SARS-CoV-2 diagnosis (positive controls), of whom 8 were asymptomatic, 58 had mild symptoms and 49 were hospitalized. Pre-existing IgG antibodies recognizing N, M and S2 proteins were detected in negative controls suggestive of cross-reactive to common cold coronaviruses. The best performing antibody isotype/antigen signatures had specificities of 100% and sensitivities of 94.94% at \geq 14 days since the onset of symptoms and 96.08% at \geq 21 days since the onset of symptoms, with AUC of 0.992 and 0.999, respectively. Combining multiple antibody markers as assessed by qSAT assays has the highest efficiency, breadth and versatility to accurately detect low-level antibody responses for obtaining reliable data on prevalence of exposure to novel pathogens in a population. Our assays will allow gaining insights into antibody correlates of immunity required for vaccine development to combat pandemics like the COVID-19.

RESULTS

Figure 1. Levels (median fluorescence intensity, MFI) of IgM, IgA and IgG antibodies to RBD antigen of SARS-CoV-2 in singleplex using samples from positive and negative individuals at different dilutions after overnight incubation at 4°C.

	IgM	lgG	IgA
--	-----	-----	-----

Figure 5. Antibody Luminex assays performance. Receiver operating characteristic (ROC) curve and area under the curve (AUC) using samples from pre-pandemic negative controls plus either all participants with positive COVID-19 diagnosis or participants with positive diagnosis at different times since onset of symptoms, comparing combinations of multiple immunoglobulin isotypes to different antigens with top performances (A) versus those of single isotype/antibody markers (B).



STUDY SAMPLES & ANTIGENS

Positive samples were **115** plasmas from individuals with a confirmed past/current diagnosis of COVID-19. One hundred and eleven had SARS-CoV-2 infection confirmed by real time reverse-transcriptase polymerase chain reaction (rRT-PCR). Fifty-five were recruited in a study of health care workers in Hospital Clínic in Barcelona, most of them with mild symptoms, 1 of them hospitalized and 6 without symptoms, all rRT-PCR positive. Fifty-seven were COVID-19 patients recruited at the Clínica Universidad de Navarra in Pamplona (Spain), of which 48 had severe symptoms and were hospitalized and 9 had mild symptoms (one clinically diagnosed with positive radiology and serology, and negative rRT-PCR); 3 were asymptomatic health workers with positive diagnosis confirmed by four serological tests but no rRT-PCR data.



Figure 2. Levels of plasma IgM, IgA and IgG antibodies to the SARS-CoV-2 antigens **S** and **RBD** at different dilutions. Comparison of antibody levels (MFI) in singleplex (orange) versus **multiplex** (burgundy); the first 10 samples from left to right are from individuals who were positive by rRT-PCR at different time periods since diagnosis, and the last two samples on the right are from individuals pre-COVID-19 pandemia.



Table 2. Performance of the assays at different thresholds targeting specificities of 100%, 99% and 98%. The top 5 performing signatures are shown.

≥14 days since onset symptoms	AUC	Specificity	Sensitivity
IgA S2 + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2	0.992	100%	94.94%
IgA S + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2	0.991	100%	94.94%
IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2	0.991	100%	94.94%
IgG S + IgM RBD	0.990	100%	94.94%
IgA S2 + IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2	0.990	100%	94.94%
laG RBD + laG S	0.984	99.22%	96.20%
$\log N + \log S^2 + \log N S$	0.979	99.22%	96 20%
$laG N + laG S + laG S^2$	0.979	99.22%	96.20%
$lg \in N + lg \in O + lg \in O = l$	0.978	99.22%	96.20%
$\log N + \log O + \log O = \log O $	0.978	99.22 %	96.20%
	0.978	99.2270	90.2076
IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG RBD + IgG S + IgG S2 + IgM S	0.990	98.44%	97.47%
IgG N + IgG RBD + IgG S + IgM S	0.989	98.44%	97.47%
IgA S + IgG N + IgG S + IgG S2 + IgM S	0.988	98.44%	97.47%
IgG N + IgG S + IgG S2 + IgM S	0.988	98.44%	97.47%
IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgG S2 + IgM S	0.988	98.44%	97.47%
≥21days since onset symptoms	AUC	Specificity	Sensitivity
≥21days since onset symptoms	AUC	Specificity	Sensitivity
≥21days since onset symptoms	AUC 0.999	Specificity 100%	Sensitivity 96.08%
≥21days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2	AUC 0.999 0.999	Specificity 100% 100%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08%
≥21days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2 IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999	Specificity 100% 100% 100%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08%
≥21 days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2 IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999	Specificity 100% 100% 100% 100%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08%
≥21 days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2 IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999	Specificity 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 100%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08%
≥21 days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2 IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S2 + IgM S	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.998 0.988	Specificity 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 99.22%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08%
≥21 days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2 IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S2 + IgM S IgG N + IgG S2	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.998 0.988 0.984	Specificity 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 99.22% 99.22%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 98.04%
≥21days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2 IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S2 + IgM S IgG N + IgG S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.998 0.998 0.988 0.984 0.989	Specificity 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 98.04% 98.04% 96.08%
≥21 days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2 IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgA RBD + IgG S + IgM RBD IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S2 + IgM S IgG N + IgG S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.998 0.998 0.988 0.988 0.984 0.999 0.999 0.999	Specificity 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 98.04% 98.04% 96.08% 96.08%
≥21days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2 IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S2 + IgM S IgG N + IgG S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.998 0.988 0.988 0.984 0.984 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999	Specificity 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 98.04% 98.04% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08%
≥21 days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2 IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S2 + IgM S IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.998 0.988 0.988 0.984 0.984 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999	Specificity 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.44%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 98.04% 98.04% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08%
≥21 days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2 IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S2 + IgM S IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.998 0.988 0.984 0.984 0.984 0.984 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999	Specificity 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.44% 98.44%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 98.04% 98.04% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 100%
$\ge 21 \text{days since onset symptoms}$ $\boxed{\text{IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2}}$ $\boxed{\text{IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2}}$ $\boxed{\text{IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2}}$ $\boxed{\text{IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD}}$ $\boxed{\text{IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2}}$ $\boxed{\text{IgG N + IgG S2 + IgM S}}$ $\boxed{\text{IgG N + IgG S2 + IgM RBD + IgM S2}}$ $\boxed{\text{IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2}}$	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.998 0.988 0.988 0.984 0.984 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999	Specificity 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.44% 98.44% 98.44%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 98.04% 98.04% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 100% 100%
≥21days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 $IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2$ $IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD$ $IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S2 + IgM S$ $IgG N + IgG S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.998 0.988 0.988 0.984 0.984 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999	Specificity 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.44% 98.44% 98.44% 98.44%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 98.04% 98.04% 98.04% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 100% 100% 100%
≥21 days since onset symptoms IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2 $IgG N + IgG S + IgM S + IgM S2$ $IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD$ $IgA RBD + IgG N + IgG N Ct + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S2 + IgM S$ $IgG N + IgG S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgG S2 + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgG S2 + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgG S2 + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgG S2 + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgG S2 + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgG S2 + IgM RBD + IgM S2$ $IgG N + IgG S + IgG S2 + IgM RBD + IgM S2$	AUC 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.998 0.988 0.988 0.984 0.984 0.984 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999 0.999	Specificity 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.22% 99.44% 98.44% 98.44% 98.44% 98.44% 98.44% 98.44% 98.44% 98.44%	Sensitivity 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 98.04% 98.04% 98.04% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 96.08% 100% 100% 100% 100%

Negative controls were plasmas from **128** healthy European donors collected before the COVID-19 pandemic, and were used individually.

Antigens were RBD (Krammer Lab), S (CHO expression), S1 (GenScript), S2 (Sino Biologicals), M (E. coli ISGlobal), N (E. coli ISGlobal), N C-terminal & N-terminal (E. *coli* CRG).

Table 1. Characteristics of individuals from whom positive samples were tested

Continuous variable		Median (IQR)
Age		49.30 (26.24)
Categorical variables	Category	N (%)
Sex	Female	71 (61.74)
CCX	Male	44 (38.26)
Symptoms	No	8 (6.96)
	Yes	107 (93.04)

Figure 3. Correlation of IgG and IgM antibody levels against RBD versus S at different dilutions showing the benefit of including multiple antigens in the panel to maximize the detection of seropositives. Cutoff values are indicated by dashed lines. Spearman test was used to assess the correlations.



Figure 4. Correlations between antibody levels measured using secondary antibodies conjugated to biotin and SAPE versus PE, for 1 h and 2 h sample incubations. The blue fitting curve was calculated using the LOESS (locally estimated scatterplot smoothing) method and the black line by linear regression. Spearman test was used to assess the correlations.

20000

20000 30000

Biotin-SAPE

Biotin-SAPE



CONCLUSIONS

We developed three novel multiplex immunoassays for quantifying IgM, IgA and IgG to eight SARS-CoV-2 protein constructs and evaluated by machine learning Random Forest classification algorithms the performance of several isotype/antigen combinations to detect any positive antibody response to infection, obtaining specificities of 100% and sensitivities of 94.94% (≥14 days since symptoms onset) or 96.08% (≥21 days since symptoms onset), and very high predictability (AUC ≥0.99). We substantially increased the sensitivity of the assay when combining isotypes/antigens compared to using only one isotype/antigen. Our qSAT assays, based on the xMAP technology, provide the best precision, accuracy and widest range of detection compared to classical qualitative (RDT) or quantitative (ELISA) assays, suited to detect low-level antibody responses expected in asymptomatic children, immunosuppressed individuals, or long-term decaying antibodies. The assays performed equally well in multiplex format, with no interference noted between antigens, even if they had overlapping epitopes. An added advantage of multiplexing is the reduced usage of sample volume, resources and time.



Acknowledgments: We thank the volunteers who donated blood for COVID-19 studies and the clinical and laboratory staff. Special thanks P. Cisteró, R.A. Mitchell, C. Jairoce, S. Alonso, J. Moreno, L. Puyol, C. Chaccour, J.L. del Pozo, M. Fernández, M. Tortajada, C. Guinovart, S. Sanz, S. Méndez, A. Llupià, E. Chóliz, A. Cruz, S. Folchs, M. Rosell, P. Sotomayor, S. Torres, S. Williams, S. Barroso, A. Trilla and P. Varela. We are grateful to F. Krammer for donation of RBD and S plasmids, to L. Mayer for assistance with literature review, and to Wilco de Jager from Luminex for technical advice. The assays development and sample collection were performed with internal funds from the investigators groups and institutions. Additional support: SLT006/17/00109, SAF2016-76080-R (AEI/FEDER, UE), NIAID-CEIRS HHSN272201400008C, CEX2018-000806-S and CERCA Program.